#### **ENVIRONMENTAL STUDIES**

## Illuminating dark fishing fleets in North Korea

Jaeyoon Park<sup>1\*†</sup>, Jungsam Lee<sup>2†</sup>, Katherine Seto<sup>3,4</sup>, Timothy Hochberg<sup>1</sup>, Brian A. Wong<sup>1,5</sup>, Nathan A. Miller<sup>1,6</sup>, Kenji Takasaki<sup>7</sup>, Hiroshi Kubota<sup>7</sup>, Yoshioki Oozeki<sup>7</sup>, Sejal Doshi<sup>8</sup>, Maya Midzik<sup>8</sup>, Quentin Hanich<sup>3</sup>, Brian Sullivan<sup>1</sup>, Paul Woods<sup>1</sup>, David A. Kroodsma<sup>1</sup>

Illegal, unreported, and unregulated fishing threatens resource sustainability and equity. A major challenge with such activity is that most fishing vessels do not broadcast their positions and are "dark" in public monitoring systems. Combining four satellite technologies, we identify widespread illegal fishing by dark fleets in the waters between the Koreas, Japan, and Russia. We find >900 vessels of Chinese origin in 2017 and >700 in 2018 fished illegally in North Korean waters, catching an estimated amount of *Todarodes pacificus* approximating that of Japan and South Korea combined (>164,000 metric tons worth >\$440 million). We further find ~3000 small-scale North Korean vessels fished, mostly illegally, in Russian waters. These results can inform independent oversight of transboundary fisheries and foreshadow a new era in satellite monitoring of fisheries.

Copyright © 2020 The Authors, some rights reserved; exclusive licensee American Association for the Advancement of Science. No claim to original U.S. Government Works. Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution NonCommercial License 4.0 (CC BY-NC).

#### INTRODUCTION

In October 2018, world leaders pledged more than \$10 billion to protect the world's oceans (1). A major objective of this initiative is to reduce illegal, unreported, and unregulated (IUU) fishing, which results in the loss of billions of dollars, threatens fish stocks and marine ecosystems, and jeopardizes the livelihoods and food security of legitimate fishers and communities (2). IUU fishing, however, is often conducted by "dark fleets"—vessels that do not appear in public monitoring systems (3, 4)—and is therefore difficult to monitor and enforce (5). Although many dark vessels operate legally and broadcast their positions on country-mandated vessel monitoring systems, these data are often tightly guarded, limiting usability for third-party oversight or transboundary management. Revealing the activities of dark vessels could address this information gap, improving transparency and accountability.

These challenges with dark fleets and IUU fishing are epitomized in the waters between North Korea, South Korea, Japan, and Russia, where geopolitical tensions and disputed boundaries create a vacuum of shared data and management (6). In these poorly observed waters, the same stocks of *Todarodes pacificus* (Japanese flying squid) are targeted by several fleets, including the Chinese distant-water fleet (7, 8). Although the Chinese fleet has fished in North Korean waters since 2004, its fishing activity and catches are only intermittently published, and not since 2016 (table S6). This lack of information sharing prevents accurate stock assessment in a fishery where reported catches have dropped by 80 and 82% in South Korean and Japanese waters, respectively, since 2003 (9, 10). This inability to assess the stock is concerning considering the critical importance of squid in the region. T. pacificus is South Korea's top seafood by production value (9), one of the top 5 seafoods consumed in Japan (11), and, until recent sanctions, was the third largest North Korean export (12).

In 2017, following North Korea's testing of ballistic missiles, the United Nations (UN) Security Council adopted resolutions to sanction the country, restricting foreign fishing after September 2017. These resolutions prohibit (i) the procurement of seafood from North Korea, (ii) joint ventures between North Korea and other countries without UN approval, and (iii) North Korea from selling or transferring fishing rights (13). Because sanctions under Chapter VII of the UN Charter are binding and implemented via domestic law and policy, any violations of these sanctions by Chinese vessels since September 2017 would constitute a violation of public international law and domestic Chinese law (13-15). Despite this, the South Korean Coast Guard has observed hundreds of vessels crossing into North Korean waters, and random inspections of these vessels by the East Sea Fisheries Management Service suggest that they are of Chinese origin (13). Evidence of continued Chinese fishing in North Korean waters is also supported by domestic Chinese documentation (13).

Here, to illuminate the activities of dark fleets in one of the most contested regions of the world's ocean, we combine local expertise with four satellite technologies. Individual technologies have distinct limitations but, when combined, can provide an informative picture of fishing activity (table S1). Automatic Identification Systems (AIS) provide detailed movement and identity information but are used by only a fraction of vessels (16). Satellite synthetic aperture radar (SAR) can identify all large metal vessels and penetrate clouds but lacks regular, global coverage of the oceans (17). The Visible Infrared Imaging Radiometer Suite (VIIRS) sensor has global, daily revisit time and can detect vessels with bright lights but is limited by clouds (18). Last, high-resolution optical imagery provides the best visual confirmation of vessel activity and type but is also limited by clouds and, until recently, was not available at high enough resolution and frequent enough revisit time to monitor fishing fleets spanning exclusive economic zones (EEZ) (19). Although these four technologies have previously been used to estimate fishing and identify individual vessels (16-19), they have not been combined to publicly reveal the activities and estimated catches of entire fleets at this scale.

#### RESULTS

To monitor the activity of these vessels, we obtained 22 days of 3-m resolution optical imagery from Earth-imaging company Planet's

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Global Fishing Watch, Washington, DC 20036, USA. <sup>2</sup>Korea Maritime Institute, Busan, South Korea. <sup>3</sup>Australian National Centre for Ocean Resources and Security, University of Wollongong, Wollongong, NSW 2522, Australia. <sup>4</sup>Environmental Studies Department, University of California at Santa Cruz, Santa Cruz, CA 95064, USA. <sup>5</sup>Marine Geospatial Ecology Lab, Nicholas School of the Environment, Duke University, Durham, NC 27708, USA. <sup>6</sup>SkyTruth, Shepherdstown, WV 25443, USA. <sup>7</sup>Japan Fisheries Research and Education Agency, Yokohama, Japan. <sup>8</sup>Planet Labs, San Francisco, CA 94107, USA.

<sup>\*</sup>Corresponding author. Email: jaeyoon@globalfishingwatch.org †These authors contributed equally to this work.

satellite constellation, PlanetScope, covering most of the claimed North Korean EEZ in 2017 and 2018 (see fig. S1 for a map of our study area). We then trained a convolutional neural network to identify pair trawlers in this imagery, as these vessels show a distinctive fishing pattern and comprise the largest proportion of foreign vessels in the region (Fig. 1, A, B, and D, and figs. S2 to S4 and S25). After identifying the location of the fleet with the neural network, we tasked Planet's 0.72-m resolution SkySat satellites to image these vessels, further verifying that they are pair trawlers (Fig. 1C). We also used SAR imagery from three different satellites to verify the location and size of the fleet (Fig. 1E, figs. S7 to S11, and tables S2 and S3). With these data, we estimate that at least 796 distinct pair trawlers operated in North Korean waters in 2017 and at least 588 did so in 2018. Only a fraction of these vessels broadcast AIS (fig. S15); but the signals from these AIS-broadcasting vessels demonstrate that the vessels originated from Chinese ports and fished in Chinese waters (Fig. 2 and figs. S12 to S17). To further verify their Chinese origin, we matched AIS detections from 140 of these vessels to Planet imagery (Fig. 1, B and D, and fig. S5). The AIS signals of these vessels corroborate the South Korean Coast Guard's inspections, confirming that they originated from China.

The second most common fishing vessels thought to be of Chinese origin in North Korean waters are large, 55- to 60-m "lighting vessels" that use bright lights to lure target species (Fig. 3A, fig. S26, and movie S3); we identify these vessels by using low-resolution, high-sensitivity optical imagery (VIIRS) acquired at night. Although several fleets in the region use lights, Chinese vessels are known to be by far the brightest, carrying up to 700 incandescent bulbs and generating over 1000 lux, equivalent to the light of some football stadiums (*13*). This brightness allows us to distinguish these vessels from other fleets in the area (figs. S18 to S24), and we confirmed this vessel classification by tasking Planet's higher-resolution SkySat to image an area where these bright vessels clustered (Fig. 3B). VIIRS enables us to estimate a minimum of 108 lighting vessels of Chinese origin operating in North Korean waters in 2017 and 130 in 2018. We also detected low-intensity lighting vessels, identified as the North Korean small-scale fleet. This fleet consists of small 10- to 20-m wooden vessels with only 5 to 20 bulbs (Fig. 3C) and Fig. S27). We further verified vessel type through SAR (Fig. 3D) and Planet imagery of the port of Chongjin, North Korea (fig. S6). We estimate that about 3000 North Korean vessels fished in the Russian EEZ during 2018 (Fig. 4D).

Data from these satellites also allow us to quantify changes in vessel activity over time. For the North Korean small-scale vessels, we estimate that the number of fishing days has increased every year in the past 4 years from 39,000 in 2015 to 222,000 in 2018 (Fig. 4D). For vessels originating from China, we estimate 91,400 fishing days during 2017 (82,600 by pair trawlers and 8800 by lighting vessels) and 67,300 fishing days during 2018 (60,700 by pair trawlers and 6600 by lighting vessels) (Fig. 4, A to C). These figures account for 70% in 2017 and 91% in 2018 of the number of fishing days one would estimate based on the number of Chinese vessels crossing into or out of North Korean waters each month, as counted by the South Korean Coast Guard (Fig. 4C and tables S4 and S5). If we conservatively assume that the catch per unit effort (CPUE) for pair trawlers and lighting vessels of Chinese origin is similar to that of



Fig. 1. Activity of pair trawlers originating from China in North Korean waters. (A) Pair trawler of Chinese origin on its way to North Korean waters (photographed by the South Korean authorities). (B) A satellite image of the pair trawler fleet operating in North Korea (PlanetScope, 3-m resolution). Gray ovals show where the neural net classifier identified pair trawlers. In this area, we received AIS messages from several vessels (only two are shown). White lines connect their most recent AIS position to the estimated position during the time of the satellite image based on extrapolating the vessel's speed and course. In white is the 9-digit Maritime Mobile Service Identity (MMSI) of each. (C) Higher-resolution image of pair trawlers in operation in North Korea (SkySat, 0.72 m). (D) AIS tracks for one of the two vessels matched to (B), showing the vessel originating from Shandong province, China. (E) Pair trawlers across our study area identified by the convolutional neural network (CNN) classifier and optical imagery. Each Planet image (24 km by 7 km) is a gray rectangle on the map, with 447 total images for this day. Light purple box shows the location of the main fleet. (F) Pair trawlers identified through another technology, SAR, by counting vessels within 535 m of one another.

2 of 7

Downloaded from http://advances.sciencemag.org/ on August 31, 2020

smaller vessels in nearby waters, the total estimated likely Chinese catch would correspond to approximately 101,300 metric tons of squid worth \$275 million in 2017 and 62,800 metric tons of squid worth \$171 million in 2018 (*13*). Such catch figures would approximate those of Japan and South Korea combined from all their surrounding seas (*13*).



Fig. 2. Origin of vessels fishing in North Korean waters. During 2017 and 2018, vessels that fished in North Korean waters originated from Chinese ports and also fished in Chinese waters. Included are all AIS positions broadcast by all vessels identified as likely fishing within the claimed North Korean EEZ. Each position was identified as fishing or nonfishing by the model described in (16).

#### DISCUSSION

This large number of previously unmonitored vessels poses a substantial challenge for stock management. A political stalemate due mainly to sovereignty conflicts and maritime boundary disputes has prevented regional joint fisheries management (20), while existing state-based efforts are ineffective because of a lack of shared vessel monitoring data, management arrangements, and comprehensive stock assessments. For instance, to prevent overfishing, South Korea sets the total allowable catch for squid, limits the lighting power of squid jiggers, bans pair trawling, and permits fewer than 40 small trawlers (13, 21–23). The likely Chinese fleet, however, targeting the same stock, uses brighter lighting power, pair trawling, and a greater number of vessels (13). Given the declining CPUEs of South Korean and Japanese squid jiggers and the drastic decline in squid larval densities since 2003 (24, 25), the large number of vessels revealed through this study is particularly concerning.

In addition to sustainability concerns, there are also substantial implications for fisheries governance and regional geopolitics. These vessels originate from China and, based on inspections by the South Korean authorities, are assumed to be owned and operated by Chinese interests (13). However, because the vessels often do not carry appropriate papers, they may plausibly be so-called "three-no boats" operating outside of official Chinese authority, with no registration, no flag, and no license to operate (26). If these vessels do not have approval from both the Chinese and North Korean governments, they are fishing illegally; Chinese regulations require ministerial approval to fish in foreign waters (15), and the UN Convention on the Law of the Sea grants coastal states sovereign rights to manage living marine



**Fig. 3. Chinese and North Korean lighting vessels. (A)** A 55- to 60-m Chinese lighting vessel near North Korean waters. (**B**) A Planet SkySat (0.72-m resolution) image of a Chinese lighting vessel. (**C**) A 10- to 20-m wooden North Korean lighting vessel in the Russian EEZ. (**D**) Vessel detections on 24 October 2017 by SAR, which detects large, metallic vessels but not smaller wooden ones [by PALSAR-2 (Phased Array L-band Synthetic Aperture Radar-2); blue box shows detection footprint, and blue dots show vessels]; and by VIIRS, 2 hours later, revealing lighting vessels with the brightest lights (red, >1000 nW/cm<sup>2</sup>/sr, mostly Chinese), with medium lights (orange, 50 to 1000 nW/cm<sup>2</sup>/sr, South Korean or Chinese), and the dimmest lights (yellow, <50 nW/cm<sup>2</sup>/sr, mostly North Korean). Vessels in (D) (i) are Chinese lighting vessels, (ii) Chinese pair trawlers (detected only by SAR), (iii) North Korean squid vessels (detected only by VIIRS), and (iv) the South Korean squid fleet.

### SCIENCE ADVANCES | RESEARCH ARTICLE



**Fig. 4. Satellites track fishing by Chinese and North Korean vessels.** (**A**) Counts of Chinese pair trawlers and (**B**) lighting vessels operating in our study area during 2017 and 2018. Because of weather conditions or incomplete coverage of the study area [e.g., Sentinel-1 footprint covers  $<^{1}/_{2}$  of the study area (fig. S9)], vessel counts are mostly underestimates, so we use the maximum value over a half-month period to estimate the number of active vessels, which is shown by the gray bars. (**C**) Estimated total number of Chinese vessels operating in each half month (gray bars) is largely consistent with the counts of vessels from the South Korean Coast Guard (black line). (**D**) Estimated number of North Korean lighting vessels operating in the Russian EEZ, 2015–2018; data for each half-month period are the maximum number of VIIRS detections below 50 nW/cm<sup>2</sup>/sr.

resources in their waters (27). Alternatively, if they are operating with approval from either or both governments, those state(s) are in violation of UN Security Council sanctions. Notably, the Chinese government has repeatedly refuted this latter scenario, confirming its support for the current sanctions (13). Regardless of the scenario, each results in the violation of either or both international and do-

mestic law. Bearing this in mind, our analysis identified over 900 distinct illegal vessels in 2017 after sanctions began and over 700 in 2018, representing the largest known case of illegal fishing perpetrated by a single distant-water fleet (*2*, *28*, *29*).

The presence of this foreign fleet also has severe consequences for North Korean small-scale fishers. Evidence suggests that competition from these larger trawlers displaces these small-scale wooden boats, shifting substantial effort to neighboring Russian waters. This kind of shift in response to foreign fleets has been documented elsewhere (30) and is also consistent with local fisheries ecology in this region. During the last trimester of the year, Japanese flying squid migrate south, through the Russian EEZ (7), providing an opportunity for the North Koreans to fish before the foreign fleets deplete the stock. A large portion of this North Korean fishing in Russian waters is, however, also illegal. The Russian government has authorized fewer than 100 North Korean boats since 2014, and in 2017, no permits were granted (13). In contrast, we estimate about 3000 vessels fished in these waters during 2018. North Korean artisanal boats are severely underequipped for the long-distance travel required to reach Russian fishing grounds (movies S1 and S2). As a result, between 2014 and 2018, 505 North Korean boats washed ashore on Japanese coasts. These incidents frequently involve starvation and deaths, and local media reports that many fishing villages on the eastern coast of North Korea have now been coined "widows' villages" (13). The illegal fishing patterns documented here likely exert a heavy toll on fish and fishers alike.

We suggest that this analysis represents the beginning of a new era in satellite monitoring of fisheries. Multiple satellite sources have long been available to government agencies for targeted surveillance. However, it is only with recent increases in data availability, accessibility, and computing power that these techniques can now be performed at large enough spatial and temporal scales-and by small, independent groups of researchers—to enable transparent fisheries monitoring. Although some aspects of this study are particular to the region (e.g., prevalence of pair trawlers), most techniques are easily transferable, such as matching AIS to vessel detections from freely available global satellite imagery or radar. And for the satellite data sources that are not yet freely available, such as commercial satellite radar or high-resolution optical imagery, the cost per image is decreasing rapidly (13). Combining these satellite technologies can reveal the activities of dark fleets, filling a major gap in the management of transboundary fisheries. Furthermore, these technologies, when accompanied by local expertise, can identify potential hot spots of illegal, unregulated, or unreported fishing. Global fisheries have long been dominated by a culture of confidentiality and concealment, and achieving a comprehensive view of fishing activities at sea is an important step toward sustainable and cooperative fisheries management.

#### MATERIALS AND METHODS

The analysis on fishing access agreements in the region is presented in section S1. All satellite data sources and methods to identify fishing vessels operating in and around North Korean waters are explained in detail in sections S2 to S5 (optical imagery in section S2, SAR in section S3, AIS in section S4, and VIIRS in section S5). We describe in section S6 the information obtained from South Korean authorities and various observations on the waters to validate our estimate of vessel presence and fishing activity. The legal analysis of the detected fishing activity is provided in section S7. Section S8 demonstrates the method for estimating the amount and the monetary value of the total catch in 2017–2018.

#### SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIALS

Supplementary material for this article is available at http://advances.sciencemag.org/cgi/content/full/6/30/eabb1197/DC1

#### **REFERENCES AND NOTES**

- 1. Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries, Republic of Indonesia, Our Ocean Conference Commitments (2018); https://ourocean2018.org/?l=our-ocean-commitments.
- D. J. Agnew, J. Pearce, G. Pramod, T. Peatman, R. Watson, J. R. Beddington, T. J. Pitcher, Estimating the worldwide extent of illegal fishing. *PLOS ONE*. 4, e4570 (2009).
- R. Pelich, M. Chini, R. Hostache, P. Matgen, C. Lopez-Martinez, M. Nuevo, P. Ries, G. Eiden, Large-scale automatic vessel monitoring based on dual-polarization sentinel-1 and AIS data. *Remote Sens.* 11, 1078 (2019).
- G. Rowlands, J. Brown, B. Soule, P. T. Boluda, A. D. Rogers, Satellite surveillance of fishing vessel activity in the ascension island exclusive economic zone and marine protected area. *Mar. Policy* **101**, 39–50 (2019).
- N. Longépé, G. Hajduch, R. Ardianto, R. de Joux, B. Nhunfat, M. I. Marzuki, R. Fablet, I. Hermawan, O. Germain, B. A. Subki, R. Farhan, A. D. Muttaqin, P. Gaspar, Completing fishing monitoring with spaceborne Vessel Detection System (VDS) and Automatic Identification System (AIS) to assess illegal fishing in Indonesia. *Mar. Pollut. Bull.* 131, 33–39 (2018).
- 6. J. B. Park, Regional Environmental Politics in Northeast Asia: Conflict and Cooperation (Routledge, 2018).
- H. Kidokoro, T. Goto, T. Nagasawa, H. Nishida, T. Akamine, Y. Sakurai, Impact of a climate regime shift on the migration of Japanese common squid (*Todarodes pacificus*) in the Sea of Japan. *ICES J. Mar. Sci.* 67, 1314–1322 (2010).
- J.-S. Lee, J.-G. Ryu, H.-K. Kee, A Study on the Status of Chinese Fishing in the East Sea off North Korea and Directions for Countermeasures. J. Fish. Bus. Adm. 48, 61–74 (2017).
- Ministry of Oceans and Fisheries of Republic of Korea, [Fisheries Information Portal Service]; https://fips.go.kr/p/S020304/.
- Fisheries Agency of Japan, [Marine fisheries production statistics]; www.maff.go.jp/j/ tokei/kouhyou/kaimen\_gyosei/index.html.
- 11. Fisheries Agency of Japan, [Status of consumption of marine products] (2016); www.jfa. maff.go.jp/j/kikaku/wpaper/h29\_h/trend/1/t1\_2\_4\_2.html.
- 12. The Observatory of Economic Complexity, Products exported by North Korea (2016); http://atlas.media.mit.edu/en/visualize/tree\_map/hs92/export/prk/all/show/2016/.
- 13. See Supplementary Materials.
- 14. V. Gowlland-Debbas, United Nations Sanctions and International Law (Brill Nijhoff, 2001).
- Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs of the People's Republic of China, [Distant water fisheries management regulations] (2003); www.moa.gov.cn/gk/tzgg\_1/bl/200305/ t20030519\_83829.htm.
- D. A. Kroodsma, J. Mayorga, T. Hochberg, N. A. Miller, K. Boerder, F. Ferretti, A. Wilson, B. Bergman, T. D. White, B. A. Block, P. Woods, B. Sullivan, C. Costello, B. Worm, Tracking the global footprint of fisheries. *Science* **359**, 904–908 (2018).
- G. Lemoine, J. Chesworth, G. Schwartz-Juste, N. Kourti, I. Shepherd, in 2004 IEEE International Geoscience and Remote Sensing Symposium (IGARSS'04) (IEEE, 2004), vol. 7, pp. 4825–4828.
- C. D. Elvidge, M. Zhizhin, K. Baugh, F.-C. Hsu, Automatic boat identification system for VIIRS low light imaging data. *Remote Sens.* 7, 3020–3036 (2015).
- U. Kanjir, H. Greidanus, K. Oštir, Vessel detection and classification from spaceborne optical images: A literature survey. *Remote Sens. Environ.* 207, 1–26 (2018).
- Y.-M. Shin, A Strategic Approach for Regional Fisheries Organization Establishment in Northeast Asia. J. Fish. Bus. Adm. 44, 1–14 (2013).
- Ministry of Oceans and Fisheries of Republic of Korea, Fisheries Information Portal Service; https://fips.go.kr/p/S020108/.
- Ministry of Oceans and Fisheries of Republic of Korea, 40 Enforcement decree of fisheries act, Articles 40. National Law Information Center (2017); http://law.go.kr/lslnfoP. do?lsiSeq=200503&efYd=20171229#0000.
- Ministry of Oceans and Fisheries of Republic of Korea, Revised implementation plan for setting and managing the total allowable catch in 2017. National Law Information Center (2017); www.law.go.kr/admRulLsInfoP.do?admRulSeq=2100000116070#AJAX.
- H. Kubota, M. Miyahara, R. Matsukura, T. Goto, Stock assessment and evaluation for the autumn breeding stock of Common squid (2017), (Japan Sea National Fisheries Research Institute, 2017), pp. 667–704.
- Korean Statistical Information Service, Status of fishing vessels and fishing activity; http://kosis.kr/statHtml/statHtml.do?orgId=307&tblId=TX\_30701\_A000&conn\_ path=l2.
- Y. Oozeki, D. Inagake, T. Saito, M. Okazaki, I. Fusejima, M. Hotai, T. Watanabe, H. Sugisaki, M. Miyahara, Reliable estimation of IUU fishing catch amounts in the northwestern Pacific adjacent to the Japanese EEZ: Potential for usage of satellite remote sensing images. *Mar. Policy* 88, 64–74 (2018).
- 27. United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea (1982); www.un.org/depts/los/ convention\_agreements/texts/unclos/unclos\_e.pdf.
- C. Breuil, D. Grima, Baseline Report Somalia, SmartFish Programme of the Indian Ocean Commission (Fisheries Management FAO component, Ebene, Mauritius, 2014), p. 22.

- J. Christensen, in *Perspectives on Oceans Past*, K. Schwerdtner Máñez, B. Poulsen, Eds. (Springer Netherlands, Dordrecht, 2016), pp. 133–153.
- T. G. Mallory, China's distant water fishing industry: Evolving policies and implications. Mar. Policy 38, 99–108 (2013).
- 31. S. Lee, H. E. Lee, in *The Making of International Law in Korea: From Colony to Asian Power* (Brill, 2016), pp. 152–153 and 176–183.
- C.-h. Park, The 50-Mile Military Boundary Zone of North Korea. Am. J. Int. Law. 72, 866–875 (1978).
- R. Pedrozo, Military activities in the exclusive economic zone: East asia focus. Int. Law Stud. Ser. US Nav. War Coll. 90, 514–543 (2014).
- S. Hong, S. Choi, J. Kim, Chapter III. Marine borders and possible fishing areas in the East Sea of North Korea in A study of the North-South Korean cooperation on joint fisheries in the West and the East Sea (1) (Korean Maritime Institute, 2007).
- 35. Embassy of Russia to the DPRK, Agreement between the Union of Soviet Socialist Republics and the Democratic People's Republic of Korea on the delimitation of the economic zone and the continental shelf (1986); www.rusembdprk.ru/images/law-base/ Document\_09.pdf.
- 36. S. K. Kim, Disputes Over the Delimitation of the Eez and the Continental Shelf in Maritime Disputes in Northeast Asia: Regional Challenges and Cooperation (Brill, 2017), vol. 3.
- Ministry of Agriculture of the Russian Federation, Order N385, The Rules of Fisheries for the Far Eastern Fishing Basin (Commonwealth of Independent States, Eastern Europe, Europe, 2013).
- Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Republic of Korea, Agreement on fisheries between Republic of Korea and Japan (1998); www.korea.kr/archive/expDocView.do?docId=28378.
- Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Japan, Agreement on fisheries between Japan and Republic of Korea (1998); https://www.mofa.go.jp/mofaj/gaiko/treaty/pdfs/A-H11-1039.pdf.
- Ministry of Oceans and Fisheries of Republic of Korea, Articles 16, 17, and 23 in Ship safety operation rules (2015); www.law.go.kr/lsEfInfoP.do?lsiSeq=173790#.
- Ministry of Oceans and Fisheries of Republic of Korea, A more meticulous safety management for offshore fishing vessels (2015); www.mof.go.kr/article/view. do?menuKey=376&boardKey=10&articleKey=18797.
- 42. Federal Agency of Fisheries of the Russian Federation, Cooperation under bilateral fisheries and fisheries agreements; www.fish.gov.ru/otraslevaya-deyatelnost/ mezhdunarodnoe-sotrudnichestvo.
- 43. Federal Agency of Fisheries of the Russian Federation, Results of the activities of the Federal Fisheries Agency in 2015 and objectives for 2016 (2016), (available at http://fish. gov.ru/files/documents/ob\_agentstve/kollegiya/itogi\_2015\_zadachi\_2016.pdf).
- 44. Federal Agency of Fisheries of the Russian Federation, Results of the activities of the Federal Fisheries Agency in 2016 and objectives for 2017 (2017); www.fish.gov.ru/ files/documents/ob\_agentstve/kollegiya/itogi\_2016\_zadachi\_2017-1.pdf.
- 45. Federal Agency of Fisheries of the Russian Federation, On measures to implement the Protocol of the 30th session of the Russian-Korean mixed commission for cooperation in the field of fisheries and the Protocol of Russian-Korean negotiations on the possibility of organizing fishing activities of Russian and Korean fishing vessels in the exclusive economic zones of the DPRK and the Russian Federation, respectively, in 2018 (2018); http://npb.fishcom.ru/soft\_na/bpa/docview.phtml?bpaid=4&code=11589&rdk=0&nv=0.
- V. V. Barinov, E. V. Osipov, S. V. Lisienko, Technological Improvement of Japanese Flying Squid Fishery. KSTU News (2016); http://klgtu.ru/science/magazine/news\_kstu/2016\_43/ %D0%98%D0%B7%D0%B2%D0%B5%D1%81%D1%82%D0%B8%D1%8F\_%D0%9A%D0 %93%D0%A2%D0%A3%20%E2%84%96%2043.pdf.
- 47. Federal Agency of Fisheries of the Russian Federation, Monitoring the development of the recommended volumes of production (catch) of aquatic biological resources, the total allowable catch not established as of December 31, 2016 (2016); http://www. fish.gov.ru/files/documents/otraslevaya\_deyatelnost/organizaciya\_rybolovstva/ osvoenie\_rekomendovannyh/kontr-oro-122016-4.xls.
- 48. Federal Agency of Fisheries of the Russian Federation, Monitoring the development of the recommended volumes of production (catch) of aquatic biological resources, the total allowable catch not established as of October 1, 2017 (2017); http://www.fish.gov. ru/files/documents/otraslevaya\_deyatelnost/organizaciya\_rybolovstva/osvoenie\_ rekomendovannyh/kontr-oro-112017-3.xlsx.
- 49. Federal Agency of Fisheries of the Russian Federation, Monitoring the development of the recommended volumes of production (catch) of aquatic biological resources, the total allowable catch not established as of September 1, 2018 (2018); http://www.fish. gov.ru/files/documents/otraslevaya\_deyatelnost/organizaciya\_rybolovstva/ osvoenie\_rekomendovannyh/kontr-oro-010918-3.xls.
- 50. Fisheries Agency of Japan, Internal document (2018).
- National Federation of Fisheries Cooperatives, Internal document, available on request, Performance of fishing operation in the Russian EEZ in 2017.
- Federal Agency of Fisheries of the Russian Federation, Results of the activities of the Federal Fisheries Agency in 2018 and objectives for 2019 (2019); www.fish.gov.ru/files/ documents/ob\_agentstve/kollegiya/itogi\_2018\_zadachi\_2019.pdf.
- 53. Fisheries Agency of Japan, Database of fishing report of squid jiggers (2018).

- 54. Federal Agency of Fisheries of the Russian Federation, Results of the activities of the Federal Fisheries Agency in 2017 and objectives for 2018 (2018); http://fish.gov.ru/ files/documents/ob\_agentstve/kollegiya/itogi\_2017\_zadachi\_2018.pdf.
- C. C. Wackerman, K. S. Friedman, W. G. Pichel, P. Clemente-Colón, X. Li, Automatic detection of ships in RADARSAT-1 SAR imagery. *Can. J. Remote Sens.* 27, 568–577 (2001).
- K. El-Darymli, P. McGuire, D. Power, C. R. Moloney, Target detection in synthetic aperture radar imagery: A state-of-the-art survey. J. Appl. Remote Sens. 7, 071598 (2013).
- S. Tian, C. Wang, H. Zhang, Ship detection method for single-polarization synthetic aperture radar imagery based on target enhancement and nonparametric clutter estimation. J. Appl. Remote Sens. 9, 096073 (2015).
- A. Marino, M. J. Sanjuan-Ferrer, I. Hajnsek, K. Ouchi, Ship detection with spectral analysis of synthetic aperture radar: A comparison of new and well-known algorithms. *Remote Sens.* 7, 5416–5439 (2015).
- W. Ao, F. Xu, in 2018 IEEE International Conference on Computational Electromagnetics (ICCEM) (2018), pp. 1–2.
- W. Ao, F. Xu, Y. Li, H. Wang, Detection and discrimination of ship targets in complex background from spaceborne ALOS-2 SAR images. *IEEE J. Sel. Top. Appl. Earth Obs. Remote Sens.* 11, 536–550 (2018).
- A. Marino, M. Sugimoto, K. Ouchi, I. Hajnsek, Validating a notch filter for detection of targets at sea with ALOS-PALSAR Data: Tokyo Bay. *IEEE J. Sel. Top. Appl. Earth Obs. Remote Sens.* 7, 4907–4918 (2014).
- I. E. Mladenova, T. J. Jackson, R. Bindlish, S. Hensley, Incidence angle normalization of radar backscatter data. *IEEE Trans. Geosci. Remote Sens.* 51, 1791–1804 (2013).
- K. Topouzelis, S. Singha, D. Kitsiou, Incidence angle normalization of Wide Swath SAR data for oceanographic applications. *Open Geosci.* 8, 450–464 (2016).
- T. Lindeberg, Image matching using generalized scale-space interest points. J. Math. Imaging Vis. 52, 3–36 (2015).
- N. R. Pal, S. K. Pal, A review on image segmentation techniques. *Pattern Recognit.* 26, 1277–1294 (1993).
- R. M. Haralick, S. R. Sternberg, X. Zhuang, Image analysis using mathematical morphology. *IEEE Trans. Pattern Anal. Mach. Intell.* PAMI-9, 532–550 (1987).
- M. Stasolla, C. Santamaria, J. J. Mallorqui, G. Margarit, N. Walker, in 2015 IEEE International Geoscience and Remote Sensing Symposium (IGARSS) (2015), pp. 2473–2476.
- C. Brekke, Automatic ship detection based on satellite SAR (Norwegian Defence Research Establishment (FFI), 2009), p. 40.
- C. Dong, J. Liu, F. Xu, Ship detection in optical remote sensing images based on saliency and a rotation-invariant descriptor. *Remote Sens.* 10, 400 (2018).
- Ministry of Oceans and Fisheries of Republic of Korea, Rules on permission and notification of fishing, Articles 3 and 13. National Law Information Center (2017); http:// law.go.kr/LSW/lsEfInfoP.do?lsiSeq=199339#.
- Y. Shikata, J. Mochihira, Y. Takao, K. Sadayasu, T. Watanabe, Relationship between squid distribution density and CPUE under squid fishing operation. J. Jpn. Fish. Soc. 81, 659–666 (2015).
- 72. L. Yan, P. Zhang, L. Yang, B. Yang, Y. Tan, Catch composition of light falling-net fishery in the central and southern South China Sea in spring of 2011. *South China Fish. Sci.* **10**, (2014).
- L. Yan, P. Zhang, B. Yang, S. Chen, Y. Li, Y. Li, P. Song, L. Lin, Relationship between the catch of Symplectoteuthis oualaniensis and surface temperature and the vertical temperature structure in the South China Sea. J. Fish. Sci. China 23, 469–477 (2016).
- Q. Yang, Y. Li, P. Zhang, Y. Tang, G. Chen, J. Zhang, Acoustic survey of the Symplectoteuthis oualaniensis resources in the South China Sea based on light falling-net. *J. Fish. China.* **37**, 1032 (2013).
- Q. Wu, G. Yu, Z. Ma, S. Ma, S. Wu, Preliminary Study on the Fisheries Catches in South China Sea via Light Falling-Net Fishing Method. *Int. J. Innov. Stud. Aquat. Biol. Fish.* 2, 1–4 (2016).
- P. Zhang, X. Zeng, L. Yang, C. Peng, X. Zhang, S. Yang, Y. Tan, B. Yang, L. Yan, Analyses on fishing ground and catch composition of large-scale light falling-net fisheries in South China Sea. South China Fish. Sci. 9, 74–79 (2013).
- 77. UEFA Stadium Lighting Guide 2016 (2016); www.uefa.com/MultimediaFiles/Download/ uefaorg/General/02/36/26/72/2362672\_DOWNLOAD.pdf.
- The South Korean Coast Guard, internal report Analysis report on Chinese vessels crossing to North Korea and Russian waters, October (2017).
- X. J. Cheng, Y. J. Feng, Squid resources and development and utilization in the eastern waters of North Korea. *Shandong Fisheries* 22, 37–38 (2005).
- United Nations, Security Council, General Assembly resolution 2371 (2017); https:// undocs.org/S/RES/2371%20(2017).
- United Nations, Security Council, General Assembly resolution 2375 (2017); https://undocs. org/S/RES/2375%20(2017).
- United Nations, Security Council, General Assembly resolution 2397 (2017); https://undocs. org/S/RES/2397%20(2017).
- D. Cortright, G. A. Lopez, L. Gerber-Stellingwerf, Sanctions, in Oxf. Handb. U. N., S. Daws, T. G. Weiss, Eds. (Oxford Univ. Press, 1 ed., 2008).

- 84. R. och Regeringskansliet, International sanctions. *Regeringskansliet* (2015); www. government.se/government-policy/foreign-and-security-policy/international-sanctions/.
- United Nations, Security Council, Note verbale dated 2 November 2017 from the Permanent Mission of China to the United Nations addressed to the Chair of the Committee (2017); www.un.org/ga/search/view\_doc.asp?symbol=S/AC.49/2017/105.
- United Nations, Security Council, Note verbale dated 12 December 2017 from the Permanent Mission of China to the United Nations addressed to the Chair of the Committee (2017); www.un.org/ga/search/view\_doc.asp?symbol=S/AC.49/2017/143.
- United Nations, Security Council, Note verbale dated 15 March 2018 from the Permanent Mission of China to the United Nations addressed to the Chair of the Committee (2018); www.un.org/ga/search/view\_doc.asp?symbol=S/AC.49/2018/35.
- United Nations, Security Council, Note by the President of the Security Council (2019); www.undocs.org/S/2019/171.
- Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs of the People's Republic of China, Office of the Ministry of Agriculture on strengthening the eastern part of North Korea, Notice of the management of marine fishery cooperation projects (2017); www.moa.gov.cn/ nybgb/2016/diqiqi/201711/t20171128\_5921825.htm.
- Jinjiang Municipal Ocean and Fisheries Bureau, 2017 work summary and 2018 work plan (2017); www.jinjiang.gov.cn/zfshow.aspx?id=51907.
- Quanzhou Municipal Ocean and Fisheries Bureau, Notice of Quanzhou Municipal Ocean and Fisheries Bureau (2017 work summary and 2018 work plan) (2018); www.quanzhou. gov.cn/zfb/xxgk/zfxxgkzl/bgzj/bmgzzj/201806/t20180607\_705842.htm.
- Jinjiang News Network, Jinjiang unicipal Oceans and Fisheries Bureau launches breeding and release of 135 million prawns into Quanzhou Bay (2017); http://news.ijjnews.com/ system/2017/09/08/011005595.shtml.
- Weihai City People's Government, Fishing vessels subject to seasonal closure must return to port and anchor by mid-day on May 1st (2018); www.weihai.gov.cn/art/2018/4/17/ art\_16952\_1275087.html.
- Weihai City Wendeng District Government, Fishing vessels subject to seasonal closure must return to port and anchor by mid-day on May 1st; www.wendeng.gov.cn// art/2018/4/19/art\_37135\_1277494.html.
- Rongcheng city news center, Rongcheng city people's government local status, Rongcheng opens a new fishing ground in Mauritania (2018); www.rongcheng.gov.cn/ art/2018/11/8/art\_40745\_1466014.html.
- 96. National Federation of Fisheries Cooperatives, Report on fisheries management, 2018 (2018), vol. 108, pp. 55.
- 97. National Federation of Fisheries Cooperatives, Report on fisheries management, 2018 (2019), vol. 110, pp. 57.
- M. Jiang, S. Ma, Z. Ma, J. Zou, S. Wu, F. Lin, J. Qin, Q. Wu, Economic Benefit Analysis of Trawlers and light trap and falling net fishing vessels in South China Sea. *Insights Aquacult. Biotechnol.* 2, 5 (2018).
- Fishing knowledge (3) fish net diagram and application technology of pair trawling. Marine Fisheries (1984); www.cnki.com.cn/Article/CJFDTotal-HTYY198403010.htm.
- 100. C.-S. Jang, W.-S. Song, M. Kang, Y.-H. Cho, B.-Y. Kim, Y.-S. An, Fishing gear and method and improvement of regulation of the middle sized trawl fishery in the East Sea of Korea. *J. Korean Soc. Fish. Technol.* **52**, 162–168 (2016).
- L. Song, X. Qu, C. Yuan, Analysis of fishing ground and resources of squid Todarodes pacificus in eastern coast of Korea Todarodes pacificus in eastern coast of Korea. *J. Dalian Fish. Univ.* 23, 123–127 (2008).
- 102. Y. Tian, H. Kidokoro, T. Fujino, Interannual-decadal variability of demersal fish assemblages in the Tsushima Warm Current region of the Japan Sea: Impacts of climate regime shifts and trawl fisheries with implications for ecosystem-based management. *Fish. Res.* **112**, 140–153 (2011).
- D. M. Son, National report on the fish stocks and habitats of regional, global and transboundary significance in the South China Sea, *National Report on Fisheries - Vietnam* (2008), 312 p.
- 104. B. Haas, South Korean heatwave causes record deaths. The Guardian (2018); www. theguardian.com/world/2018/aug/09/south-korean-heatwave-causes-record-deaths.
- T. K. Herald, S. Korea investigates alleged N. Korean coal trans-shipped to its ports (2018); www.koreaherald.com/view.php?ud=20180717000761.
- L. Harkell, Squid prices higher in China. Undercurr. News (2018); www.undercurrentnews. com/2018/04/20/squid-prices-higher-in-china/.

- 107. Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs of the People's Republic of China Bureau of Fisheries, Development overview in 2016 Chinese Fisheries Yearbook China Agriculture Press, 2016), 52 p.
- 108. Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs of the People's Republic of China, Ministry's notice on issues related to the 2015 joint fishing projects in the Eastern waters of North Korea (Bureau of Fisheries, No. 51, 2015); www.moa.gov.cn/govpublic/YYJ/201507/ t20150727\_4764259.htm.
- 109. Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs of the People's Republic of China Bureau of Fisheries, Development overview and Fisheries by region] in 2015 Chinese Fisheries Yearbook (China Agriculture Press, 2016), vol. 85, pp. 5.
- 110. Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs of the People's Republic of China, Ministry's notice of strengthening the management of fishing vessels going to the Eastern waters of North Korea (Bureau of Fisheries, No. 48, 2013); www.moa.gov.cn/govpublic/ YYJ/201307/t20130708\_3516174.htm.
- 111. Fujian Gangshun Pelagic Fishery Co. Ltd.], A feasibility study report on China-Asean (Fujian) industrial district project for distant water fishery (2013).
- 112. Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs of the People's Republic of China Bureau of Fisheries, Development overview in 2012 Chinese Fisheries Yearbook (China Agriculture Press, 2012), 39 p.
- 113. Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs of the People's Republic of China, Ministry's notice of strengthening the management of distant water fishery in the Eastern waters of North Korea (Bureau of Fisheries, No. 56, 2011); www.moa.gov.cn/govpublic/ YYJ/201105/t20110510\_1988661.htm.
- 114. Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs of the People's Republic of China Bureau of Fisheries, Development overview] in 2011 Chinese Fisheries Yearbook China Agriculture Press.

Acknowledgments: J.L. acknowledges S. Lee for recording movie clips and Y. Choi for providing data on South Korean vessels. C. D. Elvidge and F.-C. Hsu consulted on VIIRS analysis. KSAT provided processed RADARSAT-2 vessel detections. European Space Agency and Japan Aerospace Exploration Agency provided raw data of Sentinel-1 and PALSAR-2, respectively. ORBCOMM and Spire provided AIS data. We thank E. J. Tuya, A. G. Arana, and J.-C. Alonso for technical assistance and A. D. Long for overall guidance. Funding: J.P., T.H., B.A.W., N.A.M., B.S., P.W., and D.A.K. gratefully acknowledge funding by Bloomberg Philanthropies, Marisla Foundation, Oceans 5, and the Waterloo Foundation, K.S. and O.H. acknowledge support from the University of Wollongong Global Challenge Program. Y.O. acknowledges support from the stock assessment project commissioned by Japan Fisheries Agency (JFA). This work was, in part, supported by JFA, but the study contents do not necessarily reflect the views of JFA. Author contributions: J.P. and J.L. conceived the study. K.S., D.A.K., J.P., and J.L. wrote the manuscript with input from all authors. T.H., with input and guidance from S.D. and M.M., processed Planet data and built the neural net vessel classifier. J.P., B.A.W., and K.T. analyzed SAR data, N.A.M., T.H., and J.P. analyzed AIS data, J.P., T.H., and D.A.K. analyzed VIIRS data, J.L. provided research on data from the South Korean authorities and analyzed documents from China. J.P., D.K., T.H., N.A.M., and B.A.W. synthesized all data analysis results and estimated catch. J.L., K.S., J.P., and Q.H. provided legal review. H.K. and Y.O. provided data and analysis for Japanese fisheries. B.S. and P.W. provided assistance with cloud computing. D.A.K. and J.P. oversaw the project. N.A.M., J.P., T.H., D.A.K., and B.A.W. produced figures. Competing interests: The authors declare that they have no competing interests. Data and materials availability: A subset of Planet data used is available upon request from Planet. All other data that supported figures and analyses are available at https://github.com/GlobalFishingWatch/ paper-dark-fishing-fleets-in-north-korea. AIS data available for purchase from satellite companies Orbcomm and Spire.

Submitted 31 January 2020 Accepted 5 June 2020 Published 22 July 2020 10.1126/sciadv.abb1197

Citation: J. Park, J. Lee, K. Seto, T. Hochberg, B. A. Wong, N. A. Miller, K. Takasaki, H. Kubota, Y. Oozeki, S. Doshi, M. Midzik, Q. Hanich, B. Sullivan, P. Woods, D. A. Kroodsma, Illuminating dark fishing fleets in North Korea. *Sci. Adv.* **6**, eabb1197 (2020).

# **Science**Advances

#### Illuminating dark fishing fleets in North Korea

Jaeyoon Park, Jungsam Lee, Katherine Seto, Timothy Hochberg, Brian A. Wong, Nathan A. Miller, Kenji Takasaki, Hiroshi Kubota, Yoshioki Oozeki, Sejal Doshi, Maya Midzik, Quentin Hanich, Brian Sullivan, Paul Woods and David A. Kroodsma

*Sci Adv* **6** (30), eabb1197. DOI: 10.1126/sciadv.abb1197

ARTICLE TOOLS	http://advances.sciencemag.org/content/6/30/eabb1197
SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIALS	http://advances.sciencemag.org/content/suppl/2020/07/20/6.30.eabb1197.DC1
REFERENCES	This article cites 36 articles, 1 of which you can access for free http://advances.sciencemag.org/content/6/30/eabb1197#BIBL
PERMISSIONS	http://www.sciencemag.org/help/reprints-and-permissions

Use of this article is subject to the Terms of Service

Science Advances (ISSN 2375-2548) is published by the American Association for the Advancement of Science, 1200 New York Avenue NW, Washington, DC 20005. The title Science Advances is a registered trademark of AAAS.

Copyright © 2020 The Authors, some rights reserved; exclusive licensee American Association for the Advancement of Science. No claim to original U.S. Government Works. Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution NonCommercial License 4.0 (CC BY-NC).